Parallel Reporting under the ICESCR, on Women and Land, Housing and Natural Resources

The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) monitors the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) and provides guidance to States. They issue General Comments to interpret the provisions of the Covenant. The Committee’s working methods include pre-sessional working group, consideration of reports, follow-up procedure and consolidation of reports.

After review sessions, Concluding Observations are issued with findings and recommendations. NGOs can be present and participate in the periodic review sessions and submit Shadow Reports no later than a week prior to the review session. [1] During the pre-session they can submit information orally, but written information submission is also possible prior to the session as soon as possible, or prior to the consideration of a State report at any time. There is a possibility to recommend question during the pre-session.

Shadow and alternative reports:

- Definitions: the reports submitted by NGOs during the reporting process have different names. Shadow reports mean that the NGO reflects directly on the state report. When there is no state report or it is not available for the NGO, then the report submitted by the NGO is called an alternative report. Both shadow and alternative reports can be called as parallel reports. [2]

- Importance of the NGO reports: Shadow reports are seen as an assistance in the Committees work because they help in monitoring the compliance of the states with the CEDAW and ICESCR. NGO reports may point out issue and problems not covered by the state report, and may also serve to check whether the information included in the state report is valid. [3] Furthermore, NGO reports shed a light on the implementation of human rights in practice, they can be seen as important advocacy and empowerment tools and also they can raise public awareness about treaty obligations. [4]
Parallel report template

In the parallel reports, NGOs have to reflect on the report submitted by the State Parties to the CESCR. Through the examples of the right to housing and of the right to natural resources, the steps are presented under Instructions that should be taken by the NGOs to analyse the compliance of states with the ICESCR.

Right to natural resources

Article 1
1. All peoples have the right of self-determination. By virtue of that right they freely determine their political status and freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development.
2. All peoples may, for their own ends, freely dispose of their natural wealth and resources without prejudice to any obligations arising out of international economic co-operation, based upon the principle of mutual benefit, and international law. In no case may a people be deprived of its own means of subsistence.
3. The States Parties to the present Covenant, including those having responsibility for the administration of Non-Self-Governing and Trust Territories, shall promote the realization of the right of self-determination, and shall respect that right, in conformity with the provisions of the Charter of the United Nations.

Instructions

After a brief introduction about the right, the instructions are divided into two parts: firstly some questions are listed related to the respective rights that may give guidance on what should be included in the report and how the right can be approached. Secondly, three main steps are identified to assist NGOs in answering the above mentioned questions effectively.

Right to natural resources

As the global population is rising, the need and demand for natural resources is growing. Rural women and indigenous women are highly dependent on natural resources and the lack of access puts them in a vulnerable situation. The productive and sustainable use of these resources are essential but despite all the challenges, protection of natural resources is not explicitly included in ICESCR.

The text of Article 1 (2) of ICCPR is the same as Article 1 (2) of the ICESCR and the only existing general comment of the former covenant’s monitoring body connects the right to natural resources with the right to self-determination: This right entails corresponding duties for all States and the international community. States should indicate any factors or difficulties which prevent the free disposal of their natural wealth and resources contrary to the provisions of this
Article 11
1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions. The States Parties will take appropriate steps to ensure the realization of this right, recognizing to this effect the essential importance of international co-operation based on free consent.
2. The States Parties to the present Covenant, recognizing the fundamental right of everyone to be free from hunger, shall take, individually and through international co-operation, the measures, including specific programmes, which are needed:
   (a) To improve methods of production, conservation and distribution of food by making full use of technical and scientific knowledge, by disseminating knowledge of the principles of nutrition and by developing or reforming agrarian systems in such a way as to achieve the most efficient development and utilization of natural resources;

Article 12
1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health.

Article 25
Nothing in the present Covenant shall be interpreted as impairing the inherent right of all peoples to enjoy and utilize fully and freely their natural wealth and resources.

The interpretations of Article 1 (2) mostly remain silent about this right. In fact, the rights to water and sanitation, and the right to food are easier to identify under Articles 11 and 12.

Right to food and a gender sensitive approach
According to CESC GC 12
The human right to adequate food is of crucial importance for the enjoyment of all rights. It applies to everyone; thus the reference in article 11.1 to “himself and his family” does not imply any limitation upon the applicability of this right to individuals or to female-headed households [6].
The [...] right to adequate food is indivisibly linked to the inherent dignity of the human person and is indispensable for the fulfilment of other human rights enshrined in the International Bill of Human Rights. It is also inseparable from social justice, requiring the adoption of appropriate economic, environmental and social policies, at both the national and international levels, oriented to the eradication of poverty and the fulfilment of all human rights for all.

The right to adequate food is realized when every man, woman and child, alone or in community with others, have physical and economic access at all times to adequate food or means for its procurement. [8]

Right to the highest attainable standard of health and the right to water and sanitation and gender perspective
Article 12.1 provides a definition of the right to health.
In light of CESC GC 14: Health is a fundamental human right indispensable for the exercise of other human rights. Every human
being is entitled to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of health conducive to living a life in dignity [9].

The Committee interprets the right to health, as defined in article 12.1, as an inclusive right extending not only to timely and appropriate health care but also to the underlying determinants of health, such as access to safe and potable water and adequate sanitation, an adequate supply of safe food, nutrition and housing, healthy occupational and environmental conditions, and access to health-related education and information, including on sexual and reproductive health. [10]

The instrument includes information about women and the right to health and focuses on gender. To eliminate discrimination against women, there is a need to develop and implement a comprehensive national strategy for promoting women's right to health throughout their life span. [11]

Since 2010 the United Nation General Assembly explicitly recognized the human rights to safe drinking water and sanitation and the Human Rights Council reaffirmed this recognition. In the United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, women and health was a main issue. The conference document stated that the Lack of food and inequitable distribution of food for girls and women in the household, inadequate access to safe water, sanitation facilities and fuel supplies, particularly in rural and poor urban areas, and deficient housing conditions, all overburden women and their families and have a negative effect on their health. Good health is essential to leading a productive and fulfilling life, and the right of all women to control all aspects of their health, in particular their own fertility, is basic to their empowerment. [12]
CESCR GC 15 laid down that The human right to water is indispensable for leading a life in human dignity. It is a prerequisite for the realization of other human rights. [13] Attention should be given to ensuring that disadvantaged and marginalized farmers, including women farmers, have equitable access to water and water management systems [...] [14] The obligation of States parties to guarantee that the right to water is enjoyed without discrimination, and equally between men and women, pervades all of the Covenant obligations. [15] Recommendations are also included for States to ensure women’s participation in the decision-making processes and the recognition of their needs (extending safe sanitation, water supply etc).

1. Questions

- “Do women have the right to access and utilize natural resources?
- How indigenous and rural women have access to natural resources?

Water

- Is there access to safe and affordable drinking water in urban and rural areas?
- Has the State implemented measures to increase the physical and financial accessibility of water for women?
- Has the State taken measures to ensure that adequate water is available to caregivers of HIV/AIDS sufferers who require large amounts of water for their adequate care?
- What percentage of the budget in the national development plan is geared towards the goals of implementation of economic,
| • Where public utilities (e.g. water supplies) and public services (e.g. health care) have been privatised, what has been the impact on women’s access to these utilities or services? Has it had an impact on affordability? Do the services meet the specific needs of women? |
| • Has the State ensured in law and in practice that women have equal access to and are not discriminated against in the enjoyment of the right to water? |
| • Has the State instituted a national action plan to improve access to adequate water? |
| • Does this plan specifically address the needs of women? |
| • Has the State taken specific and concrete measures to implement these rights? |
| • Do these measures address the unique and disparate impact on women? |
| • Has the State provided access to judicial and administrative remedies for violations of the right to water? |
| • If so, have there been judicial/administrative decisions on these rights? Have the decisions been implemented? |
| • Has the State undertaken to educate the judiciary on these rights? |
| • Has the State sought international assistance to ensure the right to water and sanitation?” [16] |

2. Steps

Step 1

• Clarify the content and the scope of the right


- Understand the ICESCR and the essential elements of the referred articles through the relevant CESCGR General Comments concerning women and the right to water. (Use General Comments as a guide to the language of the ICESCR rights.)


- Other relevant international or regional instruments that may contain useful background information for drafting a parallel report on the right to natural resources
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All resolutions on water and sanitation: <a href="http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/WaterAndSanitation/SRWater/Pages/Resolutions.aspx">http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/WaterAndSanitation/SRWater/Pages/Resolutions.aspx</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64th World Health Assembly on Drinking-Water, Sanitation and Health: <a href="http://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/WHA64/A64_R24-en.pdf">http://apps.who.int/gb/ebwha/pdf_files/WHA64/A64_R24-en.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunger Notes report on the right to food: <a href="http://www.worldhunger.org/special/">http://www.worldhunger.org/special/</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Look at the annual reports of the Special Rapporteur
  - On the human rights to safe drinking water and sanitation:
    http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/WaterAndSanitation/SRWater/Pages/AnnualReports.aspx
  - On the right to food:
    http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Food/Pages/FoodIndex.aspx

• Look at general information on women’s right to water, food and natural resources:
  - Gender and the right to food:
  - Rural Women and the Right to Food:
    http://www.fao.org/docrep/w9990e/w9990e10.htm
  - Gender, Water and Sanitation:
  - Women, Water and Leadership:
    http://www.unwater.org/fileadmin/user_upload/unwater_new/docs/Report_Achievements_International_Deca
de_for%20Action_Water_for_Life.pdf
  - WEDO, Women and natural Resources Report in conflict situation:
• Find definitions for relevant words in focus, for example: “natural resources as social and cultural good,” “conserving and maintaining natural resources,” “adequacy,” “sustainability of food availability,” “access,” etc.

• Elaborate the most important principles, which will be emphasized in the report

Step 2

• Gather information about the country as reference points
  - Check whether the Special Rapporteur on the human rights to safe drinking water and sanitation had a country visit there: [http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/WaterAndSanitation/SRWater/Pages/CountryVisits.aspx](http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/WaterAndSanitation/SRWater/Pages/CountryVisits.aspx)
  - Check the previous Concluding Observation by the CESC on your country: [http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/TBSearch.aspx](http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/TBSearch.aspx)
  - Check if the State has submitted a report
  - Check national statistics and scholarly literature
• Include information on the status of access, exercise and enjoyment of this right by women

• Refer to national legislation (constitutions, laws, policies, internal monitoring, national human rights institutions, remedies etc.) and implementation, concerning the right in focus, highlighting successes and failures of the implementation or enforcement

• Refer to programmes and NGO-s, such as:
  Women’s Environment and Development Organization
  http://wedo.org/what-we-do/our-focus-areas/peace-conflict-natural-resources/
  South Asian Feminist Alliance for Economic, Social & Cultural Rights
  http://www.pwescr.org/safa.html
  World Resources Institute
  http://www.wri.org/publication/monitoring-impact
  Natural Resource Governance Institute
  http://resourcegovernance.org/
  International Union for Conservation of Nature
  http://www.iucn.org/

Step 3

Prepare the report:

• include identification of the gaps (who is marginalized with respect to access to, use of and control over land)

• compare the NGO’s findings to the state report (check the validity of the information provided by the state)

• suggestions/ recommendations/ specific protection measures
List of useful links and organizations for models and guidance:


- Producing Shadow Reports to the CEDAW Committee: A Procedural Guide http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/iwraw/proceduralguide-08.html
Right to land and housing

Article 11

1. The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions. The States Parties will take appropriate steps to ensure the realization of this right, recognizing to this effect the essential importance of international co-operation based on free consent.

Right to land and housing

In the ICESCR, the right to housing is acknowledged in the context of adequate standard of living. The right to land is not explicitly stated except through the right to housing. Ensuring an adequate standard of living is a challenge not only in the developing world because significant problems of homelessness and inadequate housing also exist in some of the most economically developed societies. [17]

In ICESCR Article 11, there is a reference “for himself and his family,” raising the question whether women can be discriminated against based on Article 11. General Comment No. 4 clarifies that the right to adequate housing applies to everyone. While the reference to “himself and his family” reflects assumptions as to gender roles and economic activity patterns commonly accepted in 1966 when the Covenant was adopted, the phrase cannot be read today as implying any limitations upon the applicability of the right to individuals or to female-headed households or other such groups. (...) In particular, enjoyment of this right must, in accordance with article 2 (2) of the Covenant, not be subject to any form of discrimination. [18]

Furthermore, the meaning of the right is not simply have a roof over one’s head but to live somewhere in security, peace and dignity. [19]

Finally, in order to evaluate whether housing is adequate, General Comment No. 4 lists several aspects that can be analysed: legal security of tenure, availability of services, materials, facilities and
infrastructure, affordability, habitability, accessibility, location, and cultural adequacy. [20]

1. Questions

Women in general:
- “Are there a significant number of women deprived of basic shelter and housing?
- Has the State provided sex-disaggregated data on the rates of homelessness?
- Has the State instituted a national action plan to improve access to adequate, housing?
- Has the State adopted measures to address discrimination in the private sphere, such as the home, private housing sector, and credit providers?
- Has the State ensured in law and in practice that women have equal access to and are not discriminated against in the enjoyment of the right to housing?
- Has the State provided access to judicial and administrative remedies for violations of the right to housing?
- Do social roles or cultural practices limit women’s equal access to housing?
- Have policies been instituted to increase the availability of affordable housing, especially for women and their children?
- Has the State sought international assistance to ensure the right to housing?
- Do women (including single women, single un-wed mothers, etc.) have equal rights to own/rent a home or land and to inherit land? If allowed so by law, is this also the case in practice?
- Are women able to meaningfully participate at all stages of land law?
Has the State ensured that intellectual property regulations are consistent with communities, especially indigenous groups, to access traditional plants and land areas?

Do programmes of agrarian reform or redistribution of land among groups of different ethnic origins, provide women, regardless of marital status, the right to share such redistributed land on equal terms with men?

**Intersectionality (rural, migrant, disabled women, indigenous women, women living with or affected by HIV, and minority women):**

- If housing is inadequate, especially among disadvantaged groups, what is the State doing to address this issue?
- Are people suffering with HIV/AIDS protected by law against discrimination in housing?
- Is discrimination against women with disabilities addressed in both the public and private spheres, including in housing?” [21]

2. **Steps**

**Step 1**

- Clarify the content and the scope of the right

- Understand the ICESCR and the essential elements of the referred articles through the relevant CESCR General Comments concerning women and the right to housing. (Use General Comments as a guide to the language of the ICESCR rights.)

  **General and broad interpretation of the right to housing:**
- CESCR General Comment No. 4: The Right to Housing (concept of adequacy, para 8):
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/47a7079a1.html
- CESCR General Comment No. 7: The right to adequate housing: forced evictions (definition of the term eviction and description of circumstances, protection)
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/47a70799d.html

Referral to the right to housing:
- CESCR General Comment No. 5: People with disabilities (para 15, 22, 33):
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/4538838f0.html
- CESCR General Comment No. 6: The economic, social and cultural rights of older persons (para 33):
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/4538838f11.html
- CESCR General Comment No. 14: The right to the highest attainable standard of health (para 11, 43):
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/4538838d0.html
- CESCR General Comment No. 20: Non-discrimination in ESCR:
  http://www.refworld.org/docid/4a60961f2.html

- Other relevant international or regional instruments

For example:
- Workers' Housing Recommendation, 1961 (No. 115):
- Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, Fourth World Conference on Women, 15 September 1995:
  http://www1.umn.edu/humanrts/instree/e5dplw.htm
- Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa:
• Look at the annual reports of the Special Rapporteur on adequate housing:
  http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Housing/Pages/AnnualReports.aspx

• Look at general reports on women’s right to housing and land and other resources:
  - Realizing Women’s rights to land:
  - ESCR-Net Resource page:

• Find definitions for relevant words in focus -- for example, “adequacy”

• Elaborate the most important principles, which will be emphasized in the report

Step 2

• Gather information about the country as reference points
  - Check if the Special Rapporteur on adequate housing had a country visit there:
- Check previous shadow reports:
- Check the previous Concluding Observation by the CESC
- Check if the State has submitted a report
- Check national statistics, scholarly literature

• Include information on the status of access, exercise and enjoyment of this right by women

• Refer to national legislation (constitutions, laws, policies, internal monitoring, national human rights institutions, remedies etc.) and implementation, concerning the right in focus, highlighting successes and failures of the implementation or enforcement

• Refer to relevant programmes and NGO-s, for example:
  - UN Habitat
    http://unhabitat.org/
  - International Union for Tenants
    http://www.iut.nu/index.htm

Step 3

Prepare the report:
• include identification of the gaps (who is marginalized with respect to access to, use of and control over land)
• compare the NGO’s findings to the state report (check the validity of the information provided by the state)
• suggestions/ recommendations/ specific protection measures

List of useful links and organizations for guidance and models:
Checklist

- Check if the title page includes title, author(s) or NGO name, State party name, and date of the Report
- Include a Table of contents
- Be concise, the Committee has a limited time to spend on reading the Report (A shadow/alternative report should be a maximum of 60 pages for the initial report and 40 pages for periodic reports.[22])
- Include an appendix if necessary (abbreviations, list of organizations, authors of the report, relevant text such as law etc.)
- Executive Summary: You must have an Executive Summary of your shadow/alternative report, as it assists the CEDAW/ESCR Committees in understanding what is contained in the report and where they should read more carefully on specific issues. The Executive Summary would include a summary of the main critical points of the shadow/alternative report (listed according to the Articles of the treaty) and a summary of the recommendations with reference to the critical points of the shadow/alternative report and to the challenges encountered in the implementation of the Convention/Covenant. The Executive Summary should be organized by Articles of the Convention, in the same way the report is organized. [23]
- The best way to organize a shadow/alternative report is by the Articles of the ICESCR Convention, because the ESCR Committee reviews the government report Article-by-Article. [24]
- Watch the language, make sure non-native speakers understand it too, and submit the report in English
- Check if conclusion and recommendations are concrete
References


[22] ibid. p. 17.